

COPAFS hosted Tiered Access Workshops

Funded by the Alfred P. Sloan
Foundation

Cynthia Clark
COPAFS



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Proposal for Workshop on Tiered Data Access

- Motivated by Foundations for Evidence-based Policy Act
- Goal to facilitate OMB Statistical Policy role to develop directives to enable legislative requirements
- OMB could benefit from insights from constituents interested in research access to statistical and program data sets
- Submitted proposal to Sloan Foundation to convene workshop
- Activity in line with COPAFS objective to encourage discussion among professionals on issues in federal statistics



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Invited Planning Meeting - September 2019

- Provide insights in development of FRN on data access – ideally specifying different levels of access
- Convened attendees from federal statistical agencies, contractors, and statistical data users
- Provided background on the Evidence-based Policy Commission's recommendations for data access & the Foundation Act to attendees
- Used NYU data lab as an example of a structure for data access
- Panel of government leaders discussed data access challenges



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Recommendations from discussion of key Q's

- OMB should encourage experimentation among different options for access
- Identify & address legislative barriers to use of data for program & policy evaluation meeting CIPSEA definition of statistical purpose
- Develop a continuum for mitigating risk in the 5 Safe constraints
 - Setting
 - People
 - Projects
 - Output
 - Data



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Recommendations from discussion of key Q's (continued)

- Conduct research into possible approaches for access in lieu of public-use microdata files
- Research approaches to quantification and estimation of risk of disclosure of identifying information
- Conduct holistic review of individual agency products to balance data utility with confidentiality and privacy concerns



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Invited Workshop – January 2020

- Designed around different frameworks for data access
- Focused on Five Safes, but references others
- Explore each component in detail & then review combinations of the five categories at different levels
- Invited participants included four attendees from the September planning workshop and three participants who had implemented aspects of the Five Safes (two international)



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Workshop Agenda

- Presentation on the Five Safes and their use in the NYU data lab
- Small group discussion of four of the safes – setting, people, project & output – with goal of developing a continuum of options across each category
- Review of Statistics Canada Confidentiality Classification Tool that provides quantitative assessment of the sensitivity of data
- Examination of three-tiered UK Data Service model
- Discussion of topics desired in any access protocol



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Safe Setting

- IT based solutions using encryption can facilitate a safe setting
- Continuous monitoring needs to be employed
- Physical requirements should be the exception but not the rule



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Safe People

- Training protocol is necessary & should have an ethics focus
- Affiliation with a recognized research or public institution is a means of ensuring safe people
- Individual and institutional sanctions that involve reputational cost are critical, but need to employ due process for violations
- Different levels of data sensitivity should be reflected in both training and sanctions



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Safe Projects

- Employ a sound research design involving ethical considerations and IRBs as appropriate
- Need to assess number and results of data linkages
- Reflect lawful/constitutional uses
- Useful to develop repositories of research projects for specific data sets to facilitate research development



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Safe Outputs

- Assess
 - likelihood of re-identification
 - likelihood of malevolent intruder using specified data source
 - Degree of harm/sensitivity
- Continuum of safe outputs
 - Public data – no output review
 - Researcher controlled output
 - Secure facility with restricted and reviewed output



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Stat Canada Confidentiality Classification Tool

- Quantitative assessment of the sensitivity of data
- Combines probability of different types of disclosure
 - Attribute
 - Identity
 - Inferential
 - Residual
- And Severity of harm
 - Severe, high, medium, low, negligible
- In matrix scoring level of confidentiality – 1 to 9 (highest risk)



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Stat Canada Confidentiality Classification Tool (continued)

- Use the CCT score with the accreditation level (safe people) to determine the safe setting
- Safe Setting approaches for research used by Stat Canada
 - RDCs
 - Remote system access to make requests
 - Synthetic data sets
 - Public Use Microdata Files (PUMFs)



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

UK Data Service Three-Tiered Model

- Open
- Safeguarded – researcher assert that project has a research purpose – similar to a limited public use microdata file
- Controlled –different types of access utilizing combinations of levels of Five Safe criteria
 - Safe data – treat data to protect confidentiality
 - Safe people – educate researchers to use data safely
 - Safe projects – research projects for public good
 - Safe setting – secure lab environment for personal data
 - Safe outputs – secure lab projects



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Final Discussion

1. Disclosure Review process
2. Metadata and use of data files
3. Cost of supporting a RDC & funding mechanisms
4. Balancing timeliness with access constraints
5. Communication of research results
6. Access options
7. Project purpose



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Disclosure Review

- Automatic
- Linked data sets pose additional concerns
- Strive to make researchers part of the disclosure review process
- Disclosure review needs to be principle-based
- Distinguish between
 - census/register data
 - Large data sets with high sampling fraction
 - Smaller data collections with high sensitivity
 - Data sets with low sensitivity



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Metadata and use of Data Files

- Consider designating a senior academic as primary authorized user for a given data file as a resource
- Federal agencies need to have a researcher highly knowledgeable about a data set
- Stakeholders need to be involved in options for release strategies for priority data sets
- Data producers need to be involved with research data uses and approval for release of given data sets



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Cost of Supporting a Research Data Center

- Ways to fund a Research Data Center
 - Federal agency supplying the data set
 - Grant from NSF, NIH, NIFA, or other organization
 - User Fees



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Balance Issue of Timeliness with Access Constraints

- Time sensitive research
- Lack of access to federal data may result in use of lower quality data sources
- Approaches needed for data sets formerly issued as Public Use Microdata Files



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Communication of Research Results

- Research results from access to federal data need to be made public
- Special tabulations need to be available to all
- Archives need to be established to facilitate knowledge of related research



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Access Options

- Licensing of researcher with institution
- Research certification
- Balance risk with utility, sensitivity, and cost
- Controls need to be consistent with type of access and research purpose



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Project Purpose

- Issue with users who have nefarious purpose
- Only feasible protection might be researcher certification
- Consider formal ethical approach of a proposed research project
- Equity needs to be a consideration in access protocols



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION

Follow-up to Sloan Workshop Project

- Presentation today
- Report of project on COPAFS website: www.copafs.org
- Presentation at FCSM 2020 Research and Policy Conference
- Input for individuals to respond to FRN when it is published



Council of Professional Associations on Federal Statistics



Alfred P. Sloan
FOUNDATION